

PATENT COOPERATION TREATY

REC'D 10 SEP 2004

WIPO

PCT

PCT

From the
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY

To:

see form PCT/ISA/220

WRITTEN OPINION OF THE INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY (PCT Rule 43bis.1)

Date of mailing
(day/month/year) see form PCT/ISA/210 (second sheet)

Applicant's or agent's file reference
see form PCT/ISA/220

FOR FURTHER ACTION
See paragraph 2 below

International application No.
PCT/US2004/012421

International filing date (day/month/year)
22.04.2004

Priority date (day/month/year)
22.04.2003

International Patent Classification (IPC) or both national classification and IPC
A61N1/18, A61N1/39

Applicant
MEDTRONIC PHYSIO-CONTROL CORP.

1. This opinion contains indications relating to the following items:

- ☒ Box No. I Basis of the opinion
- ☒ Box No. II Priority
- ☐ Box No. III Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability
- ☐ Box No. IV Lack of unity of invention
- ☒ Box No. V Reasoned statement under Rule 43bis.1(a)(i) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement
- ☐ Box No. VI Certain documents cited
- ☐ Box No. VII Certain defects in the international application
- ☐ Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application

2. FURTHER ACTION

If a demand for international preliminary examination is made, this opinion will usually be considered to be a written opinion of the International Preliminary Examining Authority ("IPEA"). However, this does not apply where the applicant chooses an Authority other than this one to be the IPEA and the chosen IPEA has notified the International Bureau under Rule 66.1bis(b) that written opinions of this International Searching Authority will not be so considered.

If this opinion is, as provided above, considered to be a written opinion of the IPEA, the applicant is invited to submit to the IPEA a written reply together, where appropriate, with amendments, before the expiration of three months from the date of mailing of Form PCT/ISA/220 or before the expiration of 22 months from the priority date, whichever expires later.

For further options, see Form PCT/ISA/220.

3. For further details, see notes to Form PCT/ISA/220.

Name and mailing address of the ISA:



European Patent Office
D-80298 Munich
Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx: 523656 epmu d
Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465

Authorized Officer

Chopinaud, M

Telephone No. +49 89 2399-7365



**WRITTEN OPINION OF THE
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY**

International application No.
PCT/US2004/012421

Box No. I Basis of the opinion

1. With regard to the **language**, this opinion has been established on the basis of the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
 - ☐ This opinion has been established on the basis of a translation from the original language into the following language , which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of international search (under Rules 12.3 and 23.1(b)).
2. With regard to any **nucleotide and/or amino acid sequence** disclosed in the international application and necessary to the claimed invention, this opinion has been established on the basis of:
 - a. type of material:
 - ☐ a sequence listing
 - ☐ table(s) related to the sequence listing
 - b. format of material:
 - ☐ in written format
 - ☐ in computer readable form
 - c. time of filing/furnishing:
 - ☐ contained in the international application as filed.
 - ☐ filed together with the international application in computer readable form.
 - ☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority for the purposes of search.
3. ☐ In addition, in the case that more than one version or copy of a sequence listing and/or table relating thereto has been filed or furnished, the required statements that the information in the subsequent or additional copies is identical to that in the application as filed or does not go beyond the application as filed, as appropriate, were furnished.
4. Additional comments:

**WRITTEN OPINION OF THE
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY**

International application No.
PCT/US2004/012421

Box No. II Priority

1. ☒ The following document has not been furnished:

☒ copy of the earlier application whose priority has been claimed (Rule 43*bis*.1 and 66.7(a)).

☐ translation of the earlier application whose priority has been claimed (Rule 43*bis*.1 and 66.7(b)).

Consequently it has not been possible to consider the validity of the priority claim. This opinion has nevertheless been established on the assumption that the relevant date is the claimed priority date.

2. ☐ This opinion has been established as if no priority had been claimed due to the fact that the priority claim has been found invalid (Rules 43*bis*.1 and 64.1). Thus for the purposes of this opinion, the international filing date indicated above is considered to be the relevant date.

3. Additional observations, if necessary:

Box No. V Reasoned statement under Rule 43*bis*.1(a)(i) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement

1. Statement

Novelty (N)	Yes: Claims	
	No: Claims	1-26
Inventive step (IS)	Yes: Claims	
	No: Claims	27-70
Industrial applicability (IA)	Yes: Claims	1-70
	No: Claims	

2. Citations and explanations

see separate sheet

Re Item V

Reasoned statement under Rule 66.2(a)(ii) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement

1. Reference is made to the following documents:
D1: WO 01/66182 A (CARDIAC SCIENCE INC) 13 September 2001 (2001-09-13)
D2: US 2003/028219 A1 (PICARDO ANTHONY G ET AL) 6 February 2003 (2003-02-06)
2. The present application does not meet the criteria of Article 33(1) PCT, because the subject-matter of **claim 1 is not new in the sense of Article 33(2) PCT**.

Document D1 discloses (the references in parentheses applying to this document) **a modular external defibrillator system**, comprising :
a base containing a **defibrillator module** (defibrillator module 32, figure 1);
a pod having a patient parameter module with patient lead cables attachable to a patient to collect at least one patient vital sign, the pod operable at a distance from the base (generic patient monitor 12, figure 1); and
a communication link (see claim 1, line 5) between the pod and the base to carry at least one vital sign from the pod to the base, the defibrillator module delivering a defibrillation shock to the patient based on the at least one vital sign (see claim 1, lines 6-8 and description page 8, lines 3-12).

3. The same remark can be applied for the **independent claim 12** for the same reasons (and see D1, description page 6, line 15)
4. **Dependent claims 2-11 and 13-26** contain either features known per se from the prior art or being simple constructional features. Thus they would only satisfy Art. 33(2),(3) PCT when referring to patentable independent claims.
5. The present application does not meet the criteria of Article 33(1) PCT, because the subject-matter of **claim 27 does not involve an inventive step** in the sense of Article 33(3) PCT.

The **device** described in independent claim 27 differs from that disclosed in document D1 in that the **base comprises a latching assembly to mount the pod in a releasable manner.**

The technical problem to be solved by the invention can thus be stated as that of providing a **device easy to use and compact.**

The solution proposed in claim 27 of the present application cannot be considered as involving an inventive step (Articles 33(1) PCT) for the following reason:

Document D2 pertains to a **modular medical device, base unit and module thereof wherein the base comprises a latching assembly (see paragraph 30).**

D2 refers to the same kind of device as D1. The skilled person would therefore consider to include said feature of D2 in the device described in document D1 in order to solve the problem.

6. The same remark can be applied to the **independent claims 42, 52, 57 and 67 for the same reasons.**
7. **Dependent claims 28-41, 43-51, 53-56, 58-66 and 68-70** contain either features known per se from the prior art or being simple constructional features. Thus they would only satisfy Art. 33(2),(3) PCT when referring to patentable independent claims.
8. In order to facilitate the examination of the conformity of the amended application with the requirements of Article 34(2)(b) PCT, the applicant is requested to **clearly identify the amendments carried out**, no matter whether they concern amendments by addition, replacement or deletion, and to indicate the passages of the application as filed on which these amendments are based (see also Rule 66.8(a) PCT).

If the applicant regards it as appropriate these indications could be submitted in handwritten form on a copy of the relevant parts of the application as filed.

INTERNATIONAL SEARCH REPORT

International Application No
PCT/US2004/012421

A. CLASSIFICATION OF SUBJECT MATTER
IPC 7 A61N1/18 A61N1/39

According to International Patent Classification (IPC) or to both national classification and IPC

B. FIELDS SEARCHED

Minimum documentation searched (classification system followed by classification symbols)

IPC 7 A61N

Documentation searched other than minimum documentation to the extent that such documents are included in the fields searched

Electronic data base consulted during the international search (name of data base and, where practical, search terms used)

EPO-Internal, WPI Data, PAJ

C. DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED TO BE RELEVANT

Category *	Citation of document, with indication, where appropriate, of the relevant passages	Relevant to claim No.
X	WO 01/66182 A (CARDIAC SCIENCE INC) 13 September 2001 (2001-09-13)	1,2,4,5, 12,13, 15,16,23
Y	page 6, line 11 -page 8, line 12; claim 1; figures 1,2	27,42, 52,57
Y	US 2003/028219 A1 (PICARDO ANTHONY G ET AL) 6 February 2003 (2003-02-06) paragraphs '0029!-'0034!; claims 1,61	27,42, 52,57
A	US 2002/133201 A1 (GREATBATCH WILSON ET AL) 19 September 2002 (2002-09-19) paragraphs '0140!-'0147!; claim 1; figure 1	1-70
A	US 3 865 101 A (SAPER LAWRENCE ET AL) 11 February 1975 (1975-02-11) the whole document	1-70



Further documents are listed in the continuation of box C.



Patent family members are listed in annex.

* Special categories of cited documents:

- *A* document defining the general state of the art which is not considered to be of particular relevance
- *E* earlier document but published on or after the international filing date
- *L* document which may throw doubts on priority claim(s) or which is cited to establish the publication date of another citation or other special reason (as specified)
- *O* document referring to an oral disclosure, use, exhibition or other means
- *P* document published prior to the international filing date but later than the priority date claimed

- *T* later document published after the international filing date or priority date and not in conflict with the application but cited to understand the principle or theory underlying the invention
- *X* document of particular relevance; the claimed invention cannot be considered novel or cannot be considered to involve an inventive step when the document is taken alone
- *Y* document of particular relevance; the claimed invention cannot be considered to involve an inventive step when the document is combined with one or more other such documents, such combination being obvious to a person skilled in the art.
- *&* document member of the same patent family

Date of the actual completion of the international search

3 September 2004

Date of mailing of the international search report

13/09/2004

Name and mailing address of the ISA

European Patent Office, P.B. 5818 Patentlaan 2
NL - 2280 HV Rijswijk
Tel. (+31-70) 340-2040, Tx. 31 651 epo nl,
Fax: (+31-70) 340-3016

Authorized officer

Chopinaud, M

INTERNATIONAL SEARCH REPORT

International Application No

PCT/US2004/012421

Patent document cited in search report		Publication date	Patent family member(s)	Publication date
WO 0166182	A	13-09-2001	AU 2258301 A EP 1263497 A1 JP 2003525712 T WO 0166182 A1	17-09-2001 11-12-2002 02-09-2003 13-09-2001
US 2003028219	A1	06-02-2003	EP 1412027 A1 WO 03009895 A1	28-04-2004 06-02-2003
US 2002133201	A1	19-09-2002	EP 1372782 A2 WO 02065895 A2 US 2002133086 A1 US 2002133199 A1 US 2002133200 A1 US 2002183796 A1 US 2002138112 A1 US 2002147470 A1 US 2002133211 A1 US 2002133216 A1 US 2002198569 A1 US 2002128691 A1 US 2002138110 A1 US 2002138124 A1 US 2002138107 A1 US 2002143258 A1 US 2002128689 A1 US 2002133202 A1 US 2002138108 A1 US 2002133208 A1 US 2002138113 A1 US 2002138102 A1 US 2002116028 A1 US 2002116029 A1 US 2002116033 A1 US 2002116034 A1	02-01-2004 29-08-2002 19-09-2002 19-09-2002 19-09-2002 05-12-2002 26-09-2002 10-10-2002 19-09-2002 19-09-2002 26-12-2002 12-09-2002 26-09-2002 26-09-2002 26-09-2002 03-10-2002 12-09-2002 19-09-2002 26-09-2002 19-09-2002 26-09-2002 26-09-2002 22-08-2002 22-08-2002 22-08-2002 22-08-2002
US 3865101	A	11-02-1975	DE 2510470 A1 FR 2269326 A1	13-11-1975 28-11-1975